Strong and Efficient Consistency with Consistency-Aware Durability

<u>Aishwarya Ganesan</u>, Ram Alagappan, Andrea Arpaci-Dusseau, and Remzi Arpaci-Dusseau



Distributed Storage Systems



What does a read see given a previous set of reads and writes?

What does a read see given a previous set of reads and writes?

strong • linearizability

What does a read see given a previous set of reads and writes?



What does a read see given a previous set of reads and writes?



What does a read see given a previous set of reads and writes?



Well studied and understood!

Unlike consistency models, scant attention to durability model!

Unlike consistency models, scant attention to durability model!

How writes are replicated and persisted

Unlike consistency models, scant attention to durability model!

How writes are replicated and persisted

Durability model influences consistency

Unlike consistency models, scant attention to durability model!

How writes are replicated and persisted

Durability model influences consistency

Also determines performance

Unlike consistency models, scant attention to durability model!

How writes are replicated and persisted

Durability model influences consistency

Also determines performance

Despite this importance, often overlooked!











Immediate durability



Eventual durability

Immediate durability



Eventual durability



Immediate durability replicate client persist write ack node-l node-2 node-3 enables strong consistency but too slow!

Eventual durability



Immediate durability replicate client persist write write ack node-l node-3 node-l node-2 enables strong consistency but too slow!

Eventual durability client lazily replicate and persist



ack







fast

but enables only weak consistency due to data loss upon failures!

Is it possible for a durability layer to enable *both* strong consistency and high performance?

Design the durability layer by taking the consistency model into account

Design the durability layer by taking the consistency model into account

Intuition: what a read sees is important for most consistency models

Design the durability layer by taking the consistency model into account

Intuition: what a read sees is important for most consistency models

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes data is replicated and persisted before a read is served

Design the durability layer by taking the consistency model into account

Intuition: what a read sees is important for most consistency models

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes data is replicated and persisted before a read is served delayed writes \rightarrow high performance

Design the durability layer by taking the consistency model into account

Intuition: what a read sees is important for most consistency models

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes data is replicated and persisted before a read is served delayed writes \rightarrow high performance data durable before it is read \rightarrow strong consistency even under failures

Design the durability layer by taking the consistency model into account

Intuition: what a read sees is important for most consistency models

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes data is replicated and persisted before a read is served delayed writes \rightarrow high performance data durable before it is read \rightarrow strong consistency even under failures lose some writes if failures arise before read; but, useful for many systems that use eventual durability

Design the durability layer by taking the consistency model into account

Intuition: what a read sees is important for most consistency models

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes data is replicated and persisted before a read is served delayed writes \rightarrow high performance data durable before it is read \rightarrow strong consistency even under failures lose some writes if failures arise before read; but, useful for many systems that use eventual durability

We show efficacy of CAD by providing cross-client monotonic reads a new and strong consistency property

Results



ORCA: CAD and cross-client monotonic reads for leader-based systems implemented in ZooKeeper

Results

ORCA: CAD and cross-client monotonic reads for leader-based systems implemented in ZooKeeper

Compared to strongly consistent ZooKeeper ORCA is 1.6 – 3.3x faster by using CAD higher read throughput by allowing reads at many nodes reduces latency in geo-distributed settings by 14x
Results

ORCA: CAD and cross-client monotonic reads for leader-based systems implemented in ZooKeeper

Compared to strongly consistent ZooKeeper ORCA is 1.6 – 3.3x faster by using CAD higher read throughput by allowing reads at many nodes reduces latency in geo-distributed settings by 14x Compared to weakly consistent ZooKeeper ORCA provides similar throughput and latency

but with stronger guarantees

Results

ORCA: CAD and cross-client monotonic reads for leader-based systems implemented in ZooKeeper

Compared to strongly consistent ZooKeeper ORCA is 1.6 – 3.3x faster by using CAD higher read throughput by allowing reads at many nodes reduces latency in geo-distributed settings by 14x Compared to weakly consistent ZooKeeper ORCA provides similar throughput and latency

but with stronger guarantees

Experimentally show ORCA's guarantees under failures, useful for apps

Outline

Introduction

Motivation

CAD and cross-client monotonic reads

ORCA design

Results

Summary and conclusion







Example: I'm bored at FAST and want to go home!

Linearizability



Example: I'm bored at FAST and want to go home!

Linearizability



Example: I'm bored at FAST and want to go home!

Linearizability



Example: I'm bored at FAST and want to go home!

Linearizability



latest data: no staleness

Example: I'm bored at FAST and want to go home!

Linearizability



latest data: no staleness

in-order reads across clients

Example: I'm bored at FAST and want to go home!

Linearizability



Weaker models

latest data: no staleness

in-order reads across clients

Example: I'm bored at FAST and want to go home!

Linearizability



latest data: no staleness

in-order reads across clients

Weaker models



Example: I'm bored at FAST and want to go home!

Linearizability



latest data: no staleness

in-order reads across clients

Weaker models



Example: I'm bored at FAST and want to go home!

Linearizability



latest data: no staleness

in-order reads across clients

Weaker models



stale reads out-of-order reads across clients

Example: I'm bored at FAST and want to go home!

Linearizability



latest data: no staleness

in-order reads across clients

Weaker models



stale reads out-of-order reads across clients even with monotonic reads and causal

Linearizability requires immediate durability must synchronously replicate and persist data on a majority to tolerate failures

Linearizability requires immediate durability



Linearizability requires immediate durability



Linearizability requires immediate durability



Linearizability requires immediate durability



Linearizability requires immediate durability



Linearizability requires immediate durability



Linearizability requires immediate durability



Linearizability requires immediate durability



Linearizability requires immediate durability



Linearizability requires immediate durability

must synchronously replicate and persist data on a majority to tolerate failures



Poor performance due to synchronous operations 10x slower within data center

Weaker models only require eventual durability



Weaker models only require eventual durability



Weaker models only require eventual durability



Weaker models only require eventual durability



Weaker models only require eventual durability



Weaker models only require eventual durability



Weaker models only require eventual durability



Weaker models only require eventual durability


Weaker models only require eventual durability

data buffered on one node, replication and persistence in background



Weaker models only require eventual durability

data buffered on one node, replication and persistence in background



out-of-order across clients valid under causal and monotonic reads but confusing semantics

Weaker models only require eventual durability data buffered on one node, replication and persistence in background



Many deployments prefer eventual durability for performance in fact, it is the default (e.g., MongoDB, Redis)

Weaker models only require eventual durability data buffered on one node, replication and persistence in background



Many deployments prefer eventual durability for performance in fact, it is the default (e.g., MongoDB, Redis)

Thus settle for weak consistency

Weaker models only require eventual durability data buffered on one node, replication and persistence in background

Immediate durability enables strong consistency but is slow Eventual durability is fast but enables only weaker consistency

Second and

comusing semantic

Many deployments prefer eventual durability for performance in fact, it is the default (e.g., MongoDB, Redis) Thus settle for weak consistency

Outline

Introduction

Motivation

CAD and cross-client monotonic reads ORCA design Results Summary and conclusion

Most consistency models care about what reads see

Most consistency models care about what reads see Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes

Most consistency models care about what reads see

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes

Most consistency models care about what reads see

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes



Most consistency models care about what reads see

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes



Most consistency models care about what reads see

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes



Most consistency models care about what reads see

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes



Most consistency models care about what reads see

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes

delay durability of writes	make data durable before serving reads
write client	
SI × ack S2 S3	
good performance	

Most consistency models care about what reads see

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes

delay durability of writes





Most consistency models care about what reads see

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes

delay durability of writes





Most consistency models care about what reads see

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes

delay durability of writes





Most consistency models care about what reads see

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes

delay durability of writes





Most consistency models care about what reads see

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes

delay durability of writes





Most consistency models care about what reads see

Key idea: CAD shifts the point of durability to reads from writes

delay durability of writes



make data durable before serving reads



CAD does not always incur overheads on reads reads do not immediately follow writes – natural in many workloads common case: data already durable well before applications access it





A read from a client guaranteed to return at least the latest state returned to a previous read from any client



Even in the presence of failures and across client sessions

A read from a client guaranteed to return at least the latest state returned to a previous read from any client



Even in the presence of failures and across client sessions No existing model provides this guarantee except linearizability but not with high performance

A read from a client guaranteed to return at least the latest state returned to a previous read from any client



Even in the presence of failures and across client sessions No existing model provides this guarantee except linearizability but not with high performance CAD enables this property with high performance

A read from a client guaranteed to return at least the latest state returned to a previous read from any client



Even in the presence of failures and across client sessions No existing model provides this guarantee except linearizability but not with high performance CAD enables this property with high performance

Does not prevent staleness like many weaker models

A read from a client guaranteed to return at least the latest state returned to a previous read from any client



Even in the presence of failures and across client sessions No existing model provides this guarantee except linearizability but not with high performance CAD enables this property with high performance

Does not prevent staleness like many weaker models However, avoids out-of-order data, useful in many app scenarios e.g., location-sharing, twitter timelines

Outline

Introduction

Motivation

CAD and cross-client monotonic reads

ORCA design

Results

Summary and conclusion





Implementation of consistency-aware durability and cross-client monotonic reads in leader-based majority systems



Implementation of consistency-aware durability and cross-client monotonic reads in leader-based majority systems

Leader-based systems (e.g., MongoDB, ZooKeeper)

- leader a dedicated node
- others are followers
- writes flow through leader, establishes a single order



Implementation of consistency-aware durability and cross-client monotonic reads in leader-based majority systems

Leader-based systems (e.g., MongoDB, ZooKeeper)

leader – a dedicated node others are followers

writes flow through leader, establishes a single order

Majority

data is safe when persisted on majority nodes (e.g., 3 out of 5 servers)
Same as an eventually durable system





Same as an eventually durable system





Same as an eventually durable system





Same as an eventually durable system



immediately acknowledge writes \rightarrow high performance



Same as an eventually durable system



immediately acknowledge writes → high performance

replication and persistence in background



Same as an eventually durable system



immediately acknowledge writes → high performance

replication and persistence in background











Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system





Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item *i* – index of the last update that modified *i*





Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item i – index of the last update that modified iDurability check – i durable if update-index of $i \leq$ durable-index of system





Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item i – index of the last update that modified iDurability check – i durable if update-index of $i \leq$ durable-index of system

durable-index: I a's update-index: I a is durable





Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item i – index of the last update that modified iDurability check – i durable if update-index of $i \leq$ durable-index of system

durable-index: I a's update-index: I a is durable serve read immediately





Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item i – index of the last update that modified iDurability check – i durable if update-index of $i \leq$ durable-index of system

durable-index: I a's update-index: I a is durable serve read immediately





Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item i – index of the last update that modified iDurability check – i durable if update-index of $i \leq$ durable-index of system

durable-index: I a's update-index: I a is durable serve read immediately durable-index: I b's update-index: 2 b is not durable





Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item i – index of the last update that modified iDurability check – i durable if update-index of $i \leq$ durable-index of system

durable-index: I a's update-index: I a is durable serve read immediately





Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item i – index of the last update that modified iDurability check – i durable if update-index of $i \leq$ durable-index of system

durable-index: I a's update-index: I a is durable serve read immediately







Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item i – index of the last update that modified iDurability check – i durable if update-index of $i \leq$ durable-index of system

durable-index: I a's update-index: I a is durable serve read immediately







Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item i – index of the last update that modified iDurability check – i durable if update-index of $i \leq$ durable-index of system

durable-index: I a's update-index: I a is durable serve read immediately







Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item i – index of the last update that modified iDurability check – i durable if update-index of $i \leq$ durable-index of system

durable-index: I a's update-index: I a is durable serve read immediately





Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item i – index of the last update that modified iDurability check – i durable if update-index of $i \leq$ durable-index of system

durable-index: I a's update-index: I a is durable serve read immediately





Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item i – index of the last update that modified iDurability check – i durable if update-index of $i \leq$ durable-index of system

durable-index: I a's update-index: I a is durable serve read immediately









Durable-index – index of the latest durable item in the system Update-index of item i – index of the last update that modified iDurability check – i durable if update-index of $i \leq$ durable-index of system

durable-index: I a's update-index: I a is durable serve read immediately





If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads

If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads not scalable

- If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads not scalable
- Allow reads at followers
 - lagging followers could cause out-of-order states, CAD is not sufficient

- If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads not scalable
- Allow reads at followers



If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads not scalable

Allow reads at followers



If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads not scalable

Allow reads at followers



If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads not scalable

Allow reads at followers



If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads not scalable

Allow reads at followers



If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads not scalable

Allow reads at followers



If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads not scalable

Allow reads at followers



If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads not scalable

Allow reads at followers


Cross-Client Monotonic Reads in ORCA

- If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads not scalable
- Allow reads at followers

lagging followers could cause out-of-order states, CAD is not sufficient



Cross-Client Monotonic Reads in ORCA

- If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads not scalable
- Allow reads at followers

lagging followers could cause out-of-order states, CAD is not sufficient



Cross-Client Monotonic Reads in ORCA

- If reads restricted to leader, CAD provides cross-client monotonic reads not scalable
- Allow reads at followers

lagging followers could cause out-of-order states, CAD is not sufficient



Additional mechanisms: Active sets (lease-based mechanism), not in this talk...

Outline

Introduction

Motivation

CAD and cross-client monotonic reads

ORCA design

Results

Summary and conclusion

Implemented in ZooKeeper

Implemented in ZooKeeper

Evaluate different durability models in isolation compare CAD against immediate and eventual durability

Implemented in ZooKeeper

Evaluate different durability models in isolation compare CAD against immediate and eventual durability Evaluate overall system performance

ORCA against strong and weakly consistent ZooKeeper

Write Latency Distribution



Write Latency Distribution



Write Latency Distribution



CAD writes faster than immediate durability CAD matches performance of eventual

YCSB-A: 50% W, 50% R



YCSB-A: 50% W, 50% R



YCSB-A: 50% W, 50% R



YCSB-A: 50% W, 50% R



YCSB-A: 50% W, 50% R



CAD performs similar to eventual and is faster than immediate

Strong-ZK – uses immediate durability, reads only at leader Weak-ZK – uses eventual durability, reads at many nodes ORCA – uses CAD, reads at many nodes

Strong-ZK – uses immediate durability, reads only at leader Weak-ZK – uses eventual durability, reads at many nodes ORCA – uses CAD, reads at many nodes



Strong-ZK – uses immediate durability, reads only at leader Weak-ZK – uses eventual durability, reads at many nodes ORCA – uses CAD, reads at many nodes



Strong-ZK performs poorly due to immediate durability and leader-restricted reads

Strong-ZK – uses immediate durability, reads only at leader Weak-ZK – uses eventual durability, reads at many nodes ORCA – uses CAD, reads at many nodes



Strong-ZK performs poorly due to immediate durability and leader-restricted reads

Weak-ZK performs well due to eventual durability and scalable reads

Strong-ZK – uses immediate durability, reads only at leader Weak-ZK – uses eventual durability, reads at many nodes ORCA – uses CAD, reads at many nodes



Strong-ZK performs poorly due to immediate durability and leader-restricted reads

Weak-ZK performs well due to eventual durability and scalable reads

ORCA adds little overheads compared to weak-ZK

reads that access non-durable data

Strong-ZK – uses immediate durability, reads only at leader Weak-ZK – uses eventual durability, reads at many nodes ORCA – uses CAD, reads at many nodes



Strong-ZK performs poorly due to immediate durability and leader-restricted reads

Weak-ZK performs well due to eventual durability and scalable reads

ORCA adds little overheads compared to weak-ZK

reads that access non-durable data

More experiments in the paper...

Evaluation

correctness testing using a cluster crash-testing framework geo-replicated setting micro-benchmarks

Application case studies

- location-tracking
- social-media timeline

Surprisingly, durability models are overlooked

Surprisingly, durability models are overlooked Immediate durability enables strong consistency but is slow

Surprisingly, durability models are overlooked Immediate durability enables strong consistency but is slow Eventual durability is fast but only enables weak consistency

Surprisingly, durability models are overlooked

Immediate durability enables strong consistency but is slow

Eventual durability is fast but only enables weak consistency

CAD – consistency-aware durability, a new way of thinking about durability enables both strong consistency and high performance

Surprisingly, durability models are overlooked

Immediate durability enables strong consistency but is slow

Eventual durability is fast but only enables weak consistency

CAD – consistency-aware durability, a new way of thinking about durability enables both strong consistency and high performance

CAD is useful for many deployments that currently adopt eventual durability

Surprisingly, durability models are overlooked

Immediate durability enables strong consistency but is slow

Eventual durability is fast but only enables weak consistency

- CAD consistency-aware durability, a new way of thinking about durability enables both strong consistency and high performance
 - CAD is useful for many deployments that currently adopt eventual durability

Consistency and performance are seemingly at odds – by carefully examining the underlying layer, achieve both

Surprisingly, durability models are overlooked

Immediate durability enables strong consistency but is slow

Eventual durability is fast but only enables weak consistency

- CAD consistency-aware durability, a new way of thinking about durability enables both strong consistency and high performance
 - CAD is useful for many deployments that currently adopt eventual durability

Consistency and performance are seemingly at odds – by carefully examining the underlying layer, achieve both